

Adran yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai
Department for Environment, Sustainability and Housing



Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
Welsh Assembly Government

Mr Phil Williams
Development Manager
Cardiff Council
Strategic Planning and Environment
City Hall
Cardiff
CF10 3ND

Eich cyf. Your ref: JS/JP/09/01283/C
Ein cyf. Our ref: A-PP171-13-qA805829/1
Date. Dyddiad: 11 November 2009

Dear Sir

PLANNING (LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS) ACT 1990
PLANNING (LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS) REGULATIONS
1990: REGULATION 13
INSTALLATION OF NEW LIFT FOR ACCESS FOR THE DISABLED AT WESTERN
APARTMENTS, CARDIFF CASTLE, CARDIFF
APPLICATION NO 09/01283/C

1. Consideration has been given to the application made by your Council for listed building consent for the above. The application was submitted on 11 September for determination in accordance with the provisions of Regulation 13 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990.
2. I am authorised by the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing to determine your application.
3. In considering an application for listed building consent I am required by Section 16(2) of the 1990 Act, to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the structure or its setting or any feature of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Policy relating to the alteration or extension of listed buildings is contained in Chapter 6.5 of Planning Policy Wales (March 2002). This is supplemented by Welsh Office Circular 61/96, paragraphs 93 to 99 of which provide detailed guidelines and criteria to be used in the assessment of applications for the alteration and extension of listed buildings whilst Annex D sets out general principles to be observed when dealing with applications for such works. Where the building is

Parc Cathays
Caerdydd
CF10 3NQ

Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NQ



BUDDSODDWR MEWN POBL
INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

Ffôn • Tel: 029 2082 3730
GTN: 1208 3879
Ffacs • Fax: 029 2082 5622
Ebostr • Email: stacey.pritchard@wales.gsi.gov.uk

situated in a conservation area, Section 72 of the 1990 Act requires that special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.

4. Cadw's Principal Architect has considered the proposed works and the impact on the existing listed structure and has made the following comments:

"The proposal involves a new lift from basement level to ground floor level within the main entrance of the western apartments within Cardiff Castle. I undertook a site survey of the proposed location earlier this year. In my view, the proposal will have a detrimental impact on the special character of the entrance hall and ante-room due to the following: -

1) Two very fine stained glass windows within the entrance hall will be obscured when viewed from within the interior. Views will only be possible by looking through two glass lifts walls. In addition, two further stained glass windows will be totally obscured when viewed from within the first floor ante-room. Due to the location of the lift, it will be impossible to clean, maintain or repair all of the windows in the future. It has been suggested within the application details that the windows could be adjusted to provide access. However no details or methodology are included in this application, it is not certain this alteration can be achieved. In addition, this alteration would also require listed building consent. In my view, the character of these two rooms will be adversely altered due to the spaces becoming darker. In particular, the ante-room as the lift shaft will appear 'solid' due to the use of plasterboard to line the lift shaft.

2) To form the lift shaft, it would appear a significant amount of original/early masonry would be removed from the wall construction. In my view this does not represent the minimal intervention.

3) There is little information regarding the physical appearance of the proposed lift shaft regarding materials, details and finishes. In this context, it is problematic to ascertain the exact impact upon the interior of the existing décor. In particular there is a lack of information regarding the importance/significance of the Harry Holland murals within the ante-room as the proposed lift shaft will obscure some areas of the mural.

4) There is little information or reference to the requirements of the fire officer (regarding fire separation) or compliance with building regulations save item 6.03 of Mann Williams (structural engineer's report dated May 2009). It is unclear if a refuge area adjacent to the lift shaft is required in the event of an emergency/fire for wheel chair bound disabled people. If it is not required, it is unclear how evacuation from the building will take place in such an event? Clearly if additional requirements are required this will also require listed building consent. I am concerned that the proposed arrangement may not comply with the requirements of the fire officer or building regulations.

To provide disabled access to the banquet hall is a very important objective, but it should not be to the detriment of the special character of the interior. In my view the proposal will have a significant detrimental impact on the interior of one of the most historically and architecturally important grade one listed buildings in Wales. I therefore recommend refusal of this application."

5. I agree with the Principal Architect's conclusions and accept his recommendation that listed building consent should not be granted for the proposed works. In considering the merits of the proposed development I have taken into account the information provided by RPS Planning and Development with their e-mail of 5 November 2009 but I do not consider that it affects my conclusions.

Formal Decision

6. For the reasons given above, therefore, and in exercise of the authority referred to in paragraph 2 of this letter, I hereby refuse listed building consent for the works set out in application 09/01283/C dated 21 July 2009.

7. A copy of this letter has been sent to Cadw.

Yours faithfully

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S M Jones', with a horizontal line underneath the name.

S M JONES
Deputy Head
Decisions Branch
Planning Division

Signed under authority of the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing,
one of the Welsh Ministers

Enc: Leaflet HC(LBCA)